

State Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force

MINUTES

Monday, May 23, 2022

1:30 PM

Zoom Virtual Meeting Room

OPSD Conference Room
State Office Tower, Floor 6
235 S. Beretania St.
Honolulu, HI 96813

ATTENDANCE

Members Present (10):

1. Mary Alice Evans, Director, Office of Planning and Sustainable Development as Chair of the Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force
2. Earl Yamamoto, Department of Agriculture on behalf of the Chair, Board of Agriculture
3. Pradip Pant, Statewide Transportation Planning Office on behalf of the Director, Department of Transportation
4. Michael Madsen, DOH Clean Air Branch on behalf of Deputy Director, Department of Health, Environmental Health Administration
5. Danielle Bass, State Sustainability Coordinator
6. David Forman, Director, Environmental Law Program, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, WSR School of Law
7. Emma Yuen on behalf of Administrator, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, DLNR
8. Justine Nihipali as a Member of the Hawai'i Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation Commission
9. Benjamin Sullivan as the Mayor's Representative, City and County of Honolulu
10. Melissa Miyashiro of the Blue Planet Foundation as the Legislative Representative, Environmental Non-Profit

Members Absent (9):

1. Christian Giardina, U.S. Forest Service on behalf of the Chair, Board of Land and Natural Resources
2. Vacant, researcher from College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa
3. Vacant, extension agent from College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources, University of Hawai'i at Mānoa
4. Riley Saito as the Mayor's Representative, County of Hawai'i
5. Vacant, Mayor's Representative, County of Kaua'i
6. Vacant, Mayor's Representative, County of Maui

7. Ashley Lukens of the Frost Family Foundation as the Legislative Representative, Environmental Non-Profit
8. Bobby Farias of Hawai'i Meats as the Legislative Representative, Agriculture/Ranching Association
9. Alan Gottlieb of the Hawai'i Cattlemen's Council as the Legislative Representative, Agriculture/Ranching Association

Office of Planning and Sustainable Development Staff Present (1): Brittaney Key, Marine and Coastal Zone Advocacy Council (MACZAC) administrative assistant

Public Attendees (11):

Corinne Gallardo, Office of Hawai'i State Senator Mike Gabbard; Zoe Sims, Office of Hawai'i State Representative David Tarnas; Nicole Galase, Hawai'i Cattlemen's Council; Todd Low, State of Hawai'i Aquaculture Development Program; Heather McMillen, Kaulunani Urban and Community Forestry Program; Hayley Cook, City and County of Honolulu Office of Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resiliency; Henry Curtis, Life of the Land; Hunter Heavilin, Supersistence; Tori Spence McConnell, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) Fisheries; Kimberly Willis, Our Children's Trust; Julie Yunker, Hawai'i Gas

Distributed Material:

- Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force (GHGSTF) meeting agenda for May 23, 2022
 - Draft minutes for March 16, 2022 GHGSTF meeting
 - Agriculture Permitted Interaction Group (PIG) report
 - Aquaculture and Marine Use PIG report
 - Urban Green Infrastructure PIG report
 - "Accessing an Online Zoom Meeting" (instructions for downloading and using Zoom)
-

I. Call to order, public notice, quorum

Chair Mary Alice Evans, Director of the Office of Planning and Sustainable Development (OPSD), called the meeting to order at 1:36pm. The Task Force's May 23, 2022 meeting notice was published on May 17, 2022. A quorum of 10 members was present of this 19-member task force.

Chair Evans completed GHGSTF member roll call and members of the public were invited to introduce themselves in the chat. MACZAC administrative assistant Brittaney Key reminded attendees of Zoom best practices and the recession procedure if the meeting connection was interrupted for any reason. A link to instructions for using Zoom is available on the GHGSTF's website, and the document was distributed via the Zoom chat. Ms. Key also informed those in attendance that they could direct message her if technical assistance was needed.

The procedure for public comments was announced: Chair Evans would ask Task Force members for questions or comments first, and then discussion would be opened to comment from the public for each agenda item.

II. Review and approval of March 16, 2022 meeting minutes

The minutes were approved as circulated.

III. Legislative updates from the 2022 State of Hawai'i Legislative Session

This agenda item was deferred to a future meeting.

IV. Preparing the 2023 GHGSTF preliminary report to the State Legislature pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes [HRS] §225P-4(e)(1)

A. Agriculture Permitted Interaction Group (PIG) report

The Agriculture PIG was formed at the March 16, 2022 GHGSTF meeting. It was tasked to:

- Identify and make recommendations on types of agricultural practices, agricultural policies, public land policies, and on-farm/on-ranch management practices that provide greenhouse gas sequestration, build healthy soils, and tangible economic benefits to agricultural operations in Hawai'i. To identify and make recommendations to establish short-term and long-term greenhouse gas sequestration benchmarks for agricultural activities to assist the state in meeting the Zero Emission Clean Economy Target by 2045, established by HRS §225P-5, and identify the appropriate criteria to measure baseline levels and increases in greenhouse gas sequestration, improvements in soil health, and product yield. To identify and make recommendations to increase the generation and use of compost within agricultural areas, practices, and operations. To identify and make recommendations on financial incentives and funding mechanisms to encourage greenhouse gas sequestration for the agricultural sector in Hawai'i; and other relevant agricultural measures for the preliminary report as indicated in HRS Sections 225P-4(a), 225P-4(b), and 225P-4(e)(1);
- With membership to be Earl Yamamoto and Technical Expert Nicole Galase;
- To coordinate and consult with any other permitted interaction groups, as needed

within the scope of its task and so long as there is not a quorum of the members of the Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force; and

- With a deadline and deliverable date of May 11, 2022.

As this was the first GHGSTF meeting past the deadline and deliverable date, the Agriculture PIG was invited to share its report which was submitted to the full Task Force and available to the public on the Task Force website. The report link was also shared in the chat.

Task Force member Earl Yamamoto summarized the Agriculture PIG report and noted that it repeatedly draws attention to the importance of balancing environmental benefits and the State's statutory requirements for sequestration with ensuring tangible economic benefits for agricultural operations in Hawai'i. Nicole Galase underscored that in order for sequestration initiatives to succeed in agriculture, economic drivers/incentives must be included so that implementing sequestration best practices does not burden agricultural producers.

Hunter Heavilin asked if the Agriculture PIG report constituted the entirety of the content to be included in the full Task Force's preliminary report to the Legislature. Chair Evans clarified that the PIG report is a draft to assist OPSD in preparing the GHGSTF preliminary report (as it does not have full-time staff to assign to the Task Force). She added that while the four Scope Items of the Agriculture PIG report are mandated by HRS §225P-4, the PIG's findings and recommendations regarding those statutory requirements could be expanded or revised in the final version of the Task Force's preliminary report to be submitted to the Legislature. Mr. Heavilin asked for the appropriate venue to share additional information and/or perspectives relevant to the subject matter and mandates referenced in the Agriculture PIG report. Chair Evans confirmed that he could send any comments or material by email to Ms. Key (brittaney.i.key@hawaii.gov) for consideration before the next GHGSTF meeting in June.

Task Force member Emma Yuen remarked that, although the PIG report categorized forests as a "largely static land [use]," forests are not static due to the conversion of forests into non-forested land by threats such as hooved animals, invasive species, and fire.

No further questions or comments were raised by the Task Force or the public.

Chair Evans entertained a motion to dissolve the Agriculture PIG since it had fulfilled its charged. Task Force member Danielle Bass moved to dissolve the PIG and was seconded by Task Force member Pradip Pant. No objections or reservations were stated, and the Agriculture Permitted Interaction Group was dissolved by unanimous vote.

B. Aquaculture and Marine Use PIG report

The Aquaculture and Marine Use PIG was formed at the March 16, 2022 GHGSTF meeting. It was tasked to:

- Identify and make recommendations on aquacultural practices, marine use policies,

and mitigation options that would provide greenhouse gas sequestration benefits, encourage aquacultural practices to provide greenhouse gas sequestration benefits, and provide tangible economic benefits to aquacultural operations in Hawai'i. To identify and make recommendations on land use and marine use policies and mitigation options that would encourage such aquacultural practices in Hawai'i. To identify appropriate criteria to measure baseline levels and increases in greenhouse gas sequestration, aquacultural product yield, and other key indicators of greenhouse gas sequestration from beneficial aquacultural practices. To identify and make recommendations to establish short- and long-term greenhouse gas sequestration benchmarks for aquacultural activities and increasing greenhouse gas sequestration in Hawai'i's marine environment to assist the state in meeting the Zero Emission Clean Economy Target by 2045, established by HRS §225P-5. To make recommendations that increase climate resiliency or provide greenhouse gas sequestration benefits. To identify and make recommendations on financial incentives and funding mechanisms for aquacultural activities that would promote greenhouse gas sequestration for the aquacultural sector in Hawai'i; and other relevant aquacultural, marine use, and marine environment measures for the preliminary report as indicated in HRS Sections 225P-4(a), 225P-4(b), and 225P-4(e)(1);

- With the membership to be David Forman, Christian Giardina, Ashley Lukens, Justine Nihipali, Technical Expert Todd Low, and Technical Expert to be named from UH School of Ocean and Earth Sciences (SOEST) (*tentative*);
- To coordinate and consult with any other permitted interaction groups, as needed within the scope of its task and so long as there is not a quorum of the members of the Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force; and
- With a deadline and deliverable date of May 11, 2022.

As this was the first GHGSTF meeting past the deadline and deliverable date, the Aquaculture and Marine Use PIG was invited to share its report which was submitted to the full Task Force and available to the public on the Task Force website. The report link was also shared in the chat.

Task Force member David Forman thanked Ms. Key and the PIG members for their support during the PIG report draft process. He provided a high-level overview of the report sections and reiterated hope for members of the Task Force and the public to provide input and feedback on the Aquaculture and Marine Use PIG report. Ms. Key added a follow-up from the March meeting regarding PIG membership; a Technical Expert from UH SOEST could not be found to sit on the PIG, and so the PIG report excluded information on ocean alkalinity enhancement due to reduced capacity. However, she recommended this remain an item of consideration for future revisions.

Tori Spence McConnell thanked the PIG for producing its report and for reaching out during the report draft process. Ms. McConnell asked if there would be room in the preliminary report for comparison of aquaculture emissions to different forms of land-based agriculture. Chair Evans agreed that such comparisons would be useful and while the Task Force may not be able to include them in its preliminary report, hopefully it would be possible in the

2024 final report or future reports.

Task Force member Yuen recommended including marine information from the Sustainable Hawai'i Initiative in the preliminary report. More broadly, she also suggested including actions and information from the Sustainable Hawai'i Initiative's 30x30 Watershed Protection goal in the preliminary report's recommended actions. Chair Evans thanked Task Force member Yuen for her input and agreed with inputting relevant information from the 30x30 initiatives into the GHGSTF report.

No further questions or comments were raised by the Task Force or the public.

Chair Evans entertained a motion to dissolve the Aquaculture and Marine Use PIG since it had fulfilled its charged. Task Force member Forman moved to dissolve the PIG and was seconded by Task Force member Melissa Miyashiro. No objections or reservations were stated, and the Aquaculture and Marine Use Permitted Interaction Group was dissolved by unanimous vote.

C. Urban Green Infrastructure PIG report

The Urban Green Infrastructure PIG was formed at the March 16, 2022 GHGSTF meeting. It was tasked to:

- Identify and make recommendations on land use policies and land use practices that promote increased greenhouse gas sequestration, build healthy soils, and increase climate resiliency within Hawai'i's urban environment. To identify and make recommendations on land use practices and policies that add trees or vegetation to expand the urban tree canopy in urban areas to reduce ambient temperatures, increase climate resiliency, and improve greenhouse gas sequestration in Hawai'i. To make recommendations that increase climate resiliency, provide greenhouse gas sequestration benefits, or cool urban areas. To identify and make recommendations to increase the generation and use of compost; and other relevant urban area measures for the preliminary report as indicated in HRS Sections 225P-4(a), 225P-4(b), and 225P-4(e)(1);
- With the membership to be Danielle Bass, Melissa Miyashiro, Pradip Pant, and Technical Expert Heather McMillen;
- To coordinate and consult with any other permitted interaction groups, as needed within the scope of its task and so long as there is not a quorum of the members of the Greenhouse Gas Sequestration Task Force; and
- With a deadline and deliverable date on May 11, 2022.

As this was the first GHGSTF meeting past the deadline and deliverable date, the Urban Green Infrastructure PIG was invited to share its report which was submitted to the full Task Force and available to the public on the Task Force website. The report link was also shared in the chat.

Task Force member Bass and Task Force member Pant summarized the PIG report. Task Force member Bass also noted that given the meeting's discussion on the other two PIGs'

reports, a suitable revision to the Urban Green Infrastructure PIG report would be to include more policy recommendations such as changes to capital improvement plan (CIP) financing.

Heather McMillen added that although implied in the PIG report, she wanted to directly state that trees unto themselves are infrastructure and viewing them as such could open funding opportunities. Directing funding towards understanding how trees cool urban areas and how to plant/use trees most effectively would improve urban adaptation to increased temperatures. For example, an ecosystem services assessment, especially when combined with the statewide tree canopy viewer being launched in June, would be useful for improving the strategic promotion of urban forest growth. Ms. McMillen also stressed the need to understand the social infrastructure that supports urban trees and shared news about a stewardship map that the Kaulunani Urban and Community Forestry Program had launched which shows the geographies of collaborative stewardship efforts on O'ahu and Hawai'i Island. Finally, Ms. McMillen emphasized that agroforestry had not been explored in either the Agriculture PIG report or Urban Green Infrastructure PIG report but should be examined for the full GHGSTF preliminary report because of its importance to both sequestration and food security.

Ms. Key added that agroforestry is explicitly included in the GHGSTF's mandates and would need to be addressed in its 2024 final report.

No further questions or comments were raised by the Task Force or the public.

Chair Evans entertained a motion to dissolve the Urban Green Infrastructure PIG since it had fulfilled its charged. Task Force member Bass moved to dissolve the PIG and was seconded by Task Force member Pant. No objections or reservations were stated, and the Urban Green Infrastructure Permitted Interaction Group was dissolved by unanimous vote.

V. Announcements

A. Next GHGSTF meeting

The next GHGSTF meeting is scheduled for June 15, 2022 at 1:30pm. The location is to be determined and will be announced closer to the date.

VI. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 2:23pm.